

ISSN 2811-6925



'green' industrial policy: paradigm shift and challenges



The views expressed in this paper are solely those of the author and cannot be attributed to the European Commission.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Directorate-General for Internal Market, Industry, Entrepreneurship and SMEs Directorate A – Strategy & Economic Analysis
Unit A1 – Chief Economist Unit

E-mail: GROW-A1@ec.europa.eu

European Commission B-1049 Brussels

EU single market embracing 'green' industrial policy: paradigm shift and challenges

Single Market Economics Briefs

Slavo Radosevic

LEGAL NOTICE

This document has been prepared for the European Commission however, it reflects the views only of the authors, and the European Commission is not liable for any consequence stemming from the reuse of this publication. More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (http://www.europa.eu).

	10011 070 00 00 100 10 0	100110044 0005	D : 40.0070/000000	ET DD 04 004 EN N
PDF	ISBN 978-92-68-12943-2	ISSN 2811-6925	Doi: 10.2873/983802	ET-BD-24-001-EN-N

Manuscript completed in February 2024

1st edition

Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2024

© European Union, 2024



The reuse policy of European Commission documents is implemented by the Commission Decision 2011/833/EU of 12 December 2011 on the reuse of Commission documents (OJ L 330, 14.12.2011, p. 39). Unless otherwise noted, the reuse of this document is authorised under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC-BY 4.0) licence (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). This means that reuse is allowed provided appropriate credit is given and any changes are indicated.

EU single market embracing 'green' industrial policy: paradigm shift and challenges

Prof Slavo Radosevic¹

University College London (School of Slavonic and East European Studies)

1. Introduction

The Single Market is transitioning from a rules-based open market to a mechanism focused on promoting green growth locally and globally. The challenge lies in reconciling the rule-based system, built on the belief that open and competitive markets spur growth, with industrial policies targeting structural transformation for 'green growth.' This represents a paradigmatic change fraught with political complexities and major trade-offs, posing substantial regulatory and policy challenges.

2. A shifting paradigm of the EU single market

Table 1 lists major stylised features of the shifting paradigms of the Single Market.

Table 1: The dimensions of the shifting paradigm of the EU Single Market

Role of market Role of market Economic growth Market embeddedness Market supporting paradigm Market vs policy regulation Policy rationale Market failure based Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Market knows the best' (Generic business conditions suffice) Market governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Markets and transformation failure Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation obstacles		Old/current	Emerging			
towards green growth Market embeddedness Market supporting paradigm Market vs policy regulation Market vs policy regulation Policy rationale Market failure based Policy rationale Market failure based Market sa tools of socio- growth Market knows the best' (Generic business conditions suffice) Market governance and policy coordination Market sa tools of socio- economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth Multicondary between market shaping' paradigm Market shaping' paradigm Market shaping' paradigm Market sovernance and policy coordination System and transformation failure Markets as tools of socio- economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM	Rationales					
Market embeddedness Market supporting paradigm 'Market shaping' paradigm Market vs policy regulation A sharp distinction Blurring the boundary between market governance and policy coordination Policy rationale Market failure based System and transformation failure Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth 'Market knows the best' (Generic business conditions suffice) Markets as tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Industrial ecosystem Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and	Role of market	Economic growth	Socioeconomic transformation			
Market vs policy regulation Policy rationale Market failure based Policy rationale Market failure based Policy rationale Market failure based Policy rationale Market failure based Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Generic business conditions suffice) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sa tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways)			towards green growth			
Policy rationale Market failure based System and transformation failure Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth (Generic business conditions suffice) (Generic business conditions economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence tailoring (Industrial ecosystem distinction) Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and		Market supporting paradigm				
Policy rationale Market failure based System and transformation failure Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Generic business conditions suffice) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Monitoring focus Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and	Market vs policy regulation	A sharp distinction				
Policy rationale Market failure based Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic failure Market knows the best' (Generic business conditions suffice) Deconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Downinant governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic growth Dominant governance mode Dominant governance mode Dominant governance rules Dominant governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Markets as tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and			coordination			
Allocation Directionality Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic growth Direction of techno-economic growth Convergence Dominant governance rules Dominant governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Monitoring focus Allocation Directionality Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of scooling transition pathways Market sas tools and technological pathways Market sas tools and technological pathways Market sas tools of scooling transition pathways	Policy rationale	Market failure based	System and transformation			
Direction of techno-economic growth Suffice Generic business conditions suffice) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Markets as tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market sas tools of socioeconomic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Market specific transition pathways) Market specific transition pathways Market specific transition path			failure			
growth (Generic business conditions suffice) economic and technological change (Sector specific transition pathways) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence tailoring Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Suffice) Governance of Single Market Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Covernance of Single Market	growth					
Dominant governance mode		suffice)				
Dominant governance mode Market-enhancing governance Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Market governance complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and			transition pathways)			
Complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Governance rules						
Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Givernance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Green growth outcomes and	Dominant governance mode	Market-enhancing governance				
Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens) Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens)						
Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Governance rules A single set of rules, regulatory convergence Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus A single set of rules, regulatory Regulatory flexibility and tailoring Industrial ecosystem Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Convergence tailoring						
Dominant governance level A sharp micro-macro distinction Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and	Governance rules	A single set of rules, regulatory				
Comparison Com			Ü			
Relationship to global markets Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Multilateral agreements + Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and	Dominant governance level	·	Industrial ecosystem			
Openness of SM Multilateral agreements Open Strategic Autonomy Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Metrics of SM Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and						
Metrics of SM Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and	Openness of SM	Multilateral agreements				
Monitoring focus Legislative and implementation Green growth outcomes and			Open Strategic Autonomy			
1 ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' '						
obstacles obstacles	Monitoring focus		_			
		obstacles	obstacles			

⁻

¹ This is to acknowledge that the essay was prepared under the economic advisory programme of DG GROW of the European Commission – the 2023 DG GROW Fellowship Programme. The opinions are those of the author and should not be considered as representative of the European Commission's official position.

The evolving shift is from the sole focus on economic growth towards socio-economic transformation towards green growth, from 'market supporting' towards the 'market shaping' paradigm, from a sharp distinction between market and policy towards blurring the boundary between market governance and policy coordination, from Market failure towards System and Transformation failure-based policies.

Regarding the direction of transformation, there is a shift from 'Market knows the best' (Generic business conditions suffice) towards Markets as tools of socio-economic and technological change (Sector-specific transition pathways).

The SM's governance is shifting from Market-enhancing to Market governance, complementing Stakeholders' governance (MS, EU, Regions, Employers, Trade Unions, Citizens). We observe a shift from a single set of rules and regulatory convergence towards regulatory flexibility and tailoring and from a sharp micro-macro distinction towards the Industrial Ecosystem perspective.

Regarding the relationship with the global market, there is a shift from Multilateral Agreements Towards Open Strategic Autonomy.

Monitoring focus shifts from legislative and implementation obstacles to 'green growth' outcomes and obstacles.

3. Trade-offs of the emerging paradigm of the single market

The emerging paradigm's success or failure hinges on addressing key trade-offs, notably between competition and industrial policy, the focus on consumers and firms versus ecosystems, and the tension between SM openness and strategic autonomy.

Competition vs. Industrial Policy: The trade-off between competition and industrial policy, particularly about state aid rules, raises concerns about potential distortions of competition. Resolving this requires a broader understanding of competition policy, long-term green growth objectives, and specificity in State Aid reforms to differentiate between anti-competitive and competitively neutral subsidies.

Individual Firms vs. Ecosystems: The focus of EU competition policy on individual firms conflicts with the increasing role of ecosystems, particularly in the digital domain. New entities like Important Projects of Common European Interest (IPCEI) and industrial alliances operate at the ecosystem level, challenging traditional competition policy. Integrating these entities into the evolving SM necessitates considering them from both competition and industrial policy perspectives, acknowledging their role in shaping the emerging paradigm.

SM Openness vs. Strategic Autonomy: Achieving a balance between SM openness and controlling EU technological interdependencies with the global economy requires strategic leveraging. The EU's weight in global supply chains and its preference for 'de-risking' over 'decoupling' underscores the importance of integrating economic security considerations into policies.

In summary, navigating these trade-offs is pivotal for the success of the emerging paradigm, and careful consideration of each dimension is essential to ensure a coherent and effective evolution of the EU Single Market.

4. The institutionalisation and policy mix issues

The evolving paradigm of the Single Market (SM), now incorporating industrial policy, necessitates new structures and institutions to address incompatibilities highlighted in the previous sections.

Institutional challenges in building new Single Market governance

Reconciling trade-offs between a rule-based SM and one driven by industrial policy objectives requires broadening the stakeholders involved in regulatory processes. Emerging institutionalisation of industrial alliances, Important Projects of Common European Interest (IPCEI), and Industrial Ecosystems Coordination (ICEC) recognise this. Still, regulatory or corporate capture challenges and the neglect of certain stakeholders need careful consideration. Collaboration between public bodies and the private sector is crucial, necessitating autonomous public bodies to ensure accountability for public support. Methodologies for monitoring climate spending and avoiding greenwashing are essential.

EU Single Market and policy mix issues

The EU's weak fiscal capacity leads to regulations being the dominant instrument to promote green growth. Yet, a policy mix for green growth would require a full range of instruments, including investments, tax credits, and regulations.

The bulk of investments should accelerate the adoption of the existing clean technologies, followed by investments in new technological solutions. Only then can taxes, especially tax credits, be effective instruments to change behaviour and accelerate green transformation. As the main EU-level instrument supporting green growth, regulations are effective only when complementing investments and tax credits. Overall, the EU green industrial policy would require shifting from a price-centred to an investment-centred view of 'greening'.

5. Conclusion

Accommodating industrial policy tasks into the fabric (institutional architecture) of the SM, originally conceived as a dominantly market-enhancing governance mechanism, is reaching its limits. Sooner or later, the dominant paradigm of the SM would have to change to reconcile market enhancement with policy governance. The new instruments and new goals may become incompatible with an unchanged setting or the existing market governance of the SM.

Accommodating industrial policy into the SM would require much more thought to be given to the issues of conditionalities and accountability. A robust system of industrial policy based on conditionalities and accountabilities is compatible with the rule-based system of the SM. This is a striking gap in industrial policy development in the EU. Also, a successful greening policy would need all three groups of instruments to work together and in sequence – investment, tax credits and regulations. The EU challenge is ensuring proper sequencing in the policy mix in the current institutional context with weak EU fiscal capacity and mixed EU/MS competencies in industrial policy.

GETTING IN TOUCH WITH THE EU

In person

All over the European Union there are hundreds of Europe Direct centres. You can find the address of the centre nearest you online (european-union.europa.eu/contact-eu/meet-us en)

On the phone or in writing

Europe Direct is a service that answers your questions about the European Union. You can contact this service:

- by freephone: 00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11 (certain operators may charge for these calls),
- at the following standard number: +32 22999696,
- via the following form: <u>european-union.europa.eu/contact-eu/write-us_en_</u>

FINDING INFORMATION ABOUT THE EU

Online

Information about the European Union in all the official languages of the EU is available on the Europa website (european-union.europa.eu)

EU publications

You can view or order EU publications at <u>op.europa.eu/en/publications</u>. Multiple copies of free publications can be obtained by contacting Europe Direct or your local documentation centre (<u>europeanunion.europa.eu/contact-eu/meet-us en</u>).

EU law and related documents

For access to legal information from the EU, including all EU law since 1951 in all the official language versions, go to EUR-Lex (<u>eur-lex.europa.eu</u>)

EU open data

The portal <u>data.europa.eu</u> provides access to open datasets from the EU institutions, bodies and agencies. These can be downloaded and reused for free, for both commercial and non-commercial purposes. The portal also provides access to a wealth of datasets from European countries.



